



1 WHEREAS, Plaintiffs Ponderosa Twins Plus One and Ricky Spicer (collectively,  
 2 “Plaintiffs”) initiated the above-captioned matter in the Southern District of California on September  
 3 7, 2016;

4 WHEREAS, on October 5, 2016 the above-captioned matter was transferred to the Northern  
 5 District of California at Plaintiff’s request<sup>1</sup>;

6 WHEREAS, on October 5, 2016, the Parties entered a stipulation extending the time for  
 7 Defendants iHEARTMEDIA, INC., Spotify USA Inc., Google Inc., Apple Inc., Pandora Media, Inc.,  
 8 Deezer, Inc. and SoundCloud, Inc. (together with Sony Interactive Entertainment, LLC (f/k/a/ Sony  
 9 Computer Entertainment Inc.<sup>2</sup>) (collectively, the “Defendants,” and collectively, the Defendants and  
 10 Plaintiffs, the “Parties”) to answer, move, or otherwise respond to Plaintiff’s Complaint to October  
 11 28, 2016 (Dkt. No. 19);

12 WHEREAS, Plaintiffs allege various claims against Defendants in their Complaint under  
 13 California common and statutory law, including that Defendants violate common law and California  
 14 Civil Code § 980(a)(2) by engaging in the unauthorized public performance, reproduction, and  
 15 distribution of sound recordings allegedly owned by Plaintiffs that were fixed (i.e., recorded) prior to  
 16 February 15, 1972 (“Pre-1972 Sound Recordings”), which Defendants deny; and

17 WHEREAS, numerous parallel cases are pending in other federal district courts involving  
 18 substantially similar questions under California and other state laws, *see, e.g., In re iHeartMedia*  
 19 *Pre-1972 Sound Recording Litigation*, No. 2:15-cv-04067-PSG-GJSx (C.D. Cal.); *Sheridan v. Sirius*  
 20 *XM Radio, Inc.*, No. 3:15-cv-04081-VC (N.D. Cal.); *Ponderosa Twins Plus One v. iHeartMedia,*  
 21 *Inc.*, No. 1:16-cv-00953-PAE (S.D.N.Y.); *Sheridan v. Sirius XM Radio, Inc.*, No. 15-cv-07576-  
 22 WHW-CLW (D.N.J.); *ABS Entm’t, Inc. v. CBS Corp.*, No. 1:15-cv-06801-JGK (S.D.N.Y.);  
 23 *Sheridan v. iHeartMedia, Inc.*, No. 15-cv-07574-WHW-CLW (D.N.J.); *Sheridan v. Sirius XM*

24  
 25 <sup>1</sup> In entering this stipulation, Defendants do not consent to personal jurisdiction or agree that venue  
 26 is proper in this District.

27 <sup>2</sup> In entering this stipulation, Defendant Sony Interactive Entertainment, LLC (f/k/a/ Sony Computer  
 28 Entertainment Inc.) reserves its position that it was neither properly named nor served in this case, but, if it had been properly named and served, would have until and including October 28, 2016, to respond to Plaintiffs’ complaint.

1     *Radio, Inc.*, No. 1:15-cv-07056-GHW (S.D.N.Y.); *Sheridan v. iHeartMedia, Inc.*, No. 1:15-cv-  
 2     06747-GBD (S.D.N.Y.); *ABS Entm't, Inc. v. iHeartMedia, Inc.*, No. 1:15-cv-06807-ALC  
 3     (S.D.N.Y.); *ABS Entm't, Inc. v. Cumulus Media Inc.*, No. 1:15-cv-06806-PKC (S.D.N.Y.);

4                 WHEREAS, a case involving, *inter alia*, the question of whether broadcasting published Pre-  
 5     1972 Sound Recordings requires royalty payments under the California Civil Code § 980 and  
 6     California common law currently is on appeal before the United States Court of Appeals for the  
 7     Ninth Circuit in *Flo & Eddie, Inc. v. Pandora Media, Inc.*, Case, No. 15-55287 (9th Cir., filed Feb.  
 8     24, 2015) ("*Flo & Eddie*");

9                 WHEREAS, other cases pending in federal district courts involving these and substantially  
 10    similar questions under California and other state laws have been stayed pending the resolution of  
 11    *Flo & Eddie* in the Ninth Circuit and/or similar issues concerning New York law, *Flo & Eddie, Inc. v. Sirius XM Radio, Inc.*, No. 15-1164 (2d Cir.), and Florida law, *Flo & Eddie, Inc. v. Sirius XM Radio, Inc.*, No. 15-13100 (11th Cir.), *see, e.g., Sheridan v. Sirius XM Radio, Inc. et. al.*, No. 3:15-cv-04081, Dkt. No. 32 (N.D. Cal. Oct. 28, 2015) (stayed pending outcome of *Flo & Eddie*);  
 15    *Ponderosa Twins Plus One et al. v. iHeartMedia Inc. et al.*, No. 16-cv-00953, Dkt. No. 57 (S.D.N.Y. May 3, 2016) (stayed pending outcome of Case No. 15-1164); *Sheridan v. iHeartMedia, Inc.*, No. 15-cv-07574, Dkt. No. 26 (D.N.J. March 15, 2016) (stayed pending outcome of *Flo & Eddie*, Case No. 15-1164, and Case No. No. 15-13100);

19                 WHEREAS, the Parties believe that a stay is appropriate because the Ninth Circuit's decision  
 20    in *Flo & Eddie* regarding whether California Civil Code § 980 requires royalty payments for  
 21    broadcasting published Pre-1972 Sound Recordings is likely to be dispositive of many, if not all, of  
 22    the issues presented in the above-captioned matter, *see Stark v. Wickard*, 321 U.S. 288, 310–11  
 23    (1944) ("If numerous parallel cases are filed, the courts have . . . authority to stay . . . until the  
 24    determination of a test case."); *Leyva v. Certified Grocers of Cal., Ltd.*, 593 F.2d 857, 863-64 (9th  
 25    Cir. 1979) (district courts "may, with propriety, find it is efficient for its own docket and the fairest  
 26    course for the parties to enter a stay of an action before it, pending resolution of independent  
 27    proceedings which bear upon the case");

WHEREAS, the Parties have not requested or stipulated to any stays or extensions other than the stipulation described above extending the time to answer, move or respond to Plaintiff's Complaint;

WHEREAS, a stay would toll all deadlines in the above-captioned matter; and

WHEREAS, pursuant to Local Rule 5-1(i), the filer of this document attests that concurrence in the filing of this document has been obtained from each of the other signatories.

NOW THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED by the Parties, subject to the Order of the Court:

1. All proceedings in the above-captioned matter shall be stayed pending the issuance of a final order in *Flo & Eddie*.

2. Within thirty days of the issuance of a final order in *Flo & Eddie*, the Parties shall file a joint status report apprising the Court of how the Parties wish to proceed.

Dated: October 20, 2016

Respectfully submitted,

KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP

/s/ *Diana M. Torres*  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Attorney for Defendant Apple Inc.  
Email: diana.torres@kirkland.com

(SIGNATURE BLOCKS ON FOLLOWING PAGES)

1 Jennifer Liakos  
2 Hunter J. Shkolnik (Pro Hac Vice Pending)  
3 Paul J. Napoli (Pro Hac Vice Pending)  
4 Paul B. Maslo (Pro Hac Vice Pending)  
5 Salvatore C. Badala (Pro Hac Vice Pending)  
6 **NAPOLI SHKOLNIK PLLC**  
7 525 South Douglas Street, Suite 260  
8 El Segundo, CA 90245  
9 Telephone: (310) 31-8224  
10 Fax: (646) 843-7603  
11 Email: jliakos@napolilaw.com  
12 Email: hunter@napolilaw.com  
13 Email: pnapoli@napolilaw.com  
14 Email: pmaslo@napolilaw.com  
15 Email: sbadala@napolilaw.com

16 Brittany Weiner (Pro Hac Vice Pending)  
17 Imbesi Law P.C.  
18 450 Seventh Avenue, Suite 1408  
19 New York, New York 10123  
20 (212) 736-0007  
21 Email: Brittany@lawicm.com

22 *Counsel for Plaintiffs*

23 */s/Michael H. Rubin*  
24 Michael H. Rubin  
25 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH &  
26 ROSATI  
27 One Market Plaza  
28 Spear Tower, Suite 3300  
San Francisco, CA 94105-1126  
Telephone: (415) 947-2000  
Facsimile: (415) 947-2099  
Email: mrubin@wsgr.com

29 *Counsel for Defendants Spotify USA Inc. and*  
30 *Google Inc.*

*/s/Ian C. Ballon*

Ian C. Ballon (SBN 141819)  
GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP  
1840 Century Park East, 19th Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90067-2121  
Tel: 310-586-7700  
Fax: 310-586-7800  
Email: Ballon@gtlaw.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Deezer, Inc. and*  
*SoundCloud, Inc.*

*/s/Joseph Petersen*

Joseph Petersen (SBN 304597)  
KILPATRICK TOWNSEND & STOCKTON  
LLP  
1080 Marsh Road  
Menlo Park, CA 94025  
Telephone: 650-326-2400  
Facsimile: 650 644 0570  
Email: jpetersen@kilpatricktownsend.com

*Counsel for Sony Interactive Entertainment*  
*Network America LLC (wrongly sued herein as*  
*Sony Interactive Entertainment, LLC (f/k/a Sony*  
*Computer Entertainment Inc.))*

*/s/Andrew M. Gass*

Andrew M. Gass (SBN 259694)  
James K. Lynch (SBN 178600)  
LATHAM & WATKINS LLP  
505 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000  
San Francisco, California 94111  
Telephone: 415-391-0600  
Email: andrew.gass@lw.com  
Email: jim.lynch@lw.com

*Counsel for Defendants iHeartMedia, Inc.  
and Pandora Media, Inc.*

**PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED**

Dated: October 21, 2016

Honorable Maria-Elena James  
United States District Court Magistrate Judge

1                   **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

2                   On October 20, 2016, a true and correct copy of the foregoing were served to all Counsel of  
3 record who are deemed to have consented to electronic service via the Court's CM/ECF system per  
4 Civ. L.R. 5.4(d).

5                    FEDERAL: I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of  
6 America that the foregoing is true and correct.

7                   Executed on October 20, 2016, in Los Angeles, California.

8                   \_\_\_\_\_  
9                   /s/ *Diana M. Torres*  
Diana M. Torres

10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28